

Arlington Historic District Commissions

January 26, 2012
Whittemore Robbins House

FINAL AND APPROVED MINUTES

**COMMISSIONERS
PRESENT:**

D. Baldwin, B. Cohen, J. Cummings, D. Levy, S. Makowka,
T. Smurzynski

**COMMISSIONERS
NOT PRESENT:**

J. Black, M. Logan, J. Nyberg, M. Penzenik, J. Worden

GUESTS:

P. White, J. Silverman, J. Burke

1. AHDC Meeting Opens 8:00pm
2. Appointment of alternate Commissioners. Pleasant Street – J. Cummings, D. Levy, S. Makowka appointed to Pleasant Street Historic District Commission
3. Approval of draft minutes. S. Makowka moved approval of October 27 minutes, seconded by T. Smurzynski, voted unanimous approval. S. Makowka moved that the December 1, 2011 minutes be tabled until next meeting, seconded by B. Cohen, approved unanimously.
4. Communications
 - a. Email to D. Levy from J. Silverman re: possible renovations at 10 Montague Street
 - b. 2011 Annual Report filed with Town Manager's office
 - c. Email re: 20 Prescott Street neighbor complaining about a/c compressor location and gas furnace exhaust. AHDC has no jurisdiction over the noise, but we do have jurisdiction over placement of the a/c units. B. Cohen and S. Makowka will confer about issues.
 - d. D. Levy received email about neighbor thinking about installation of solar panels and responded for them to the neighborhood list suggesting they come to the HDC for information. Discussion ensued about solar panels in a district and whether we need to insert something into our design guidelines. B. Cohen offered to draft possible guideline addendum for the Commissions to review.
 - e. D. Baldwin communicated to S. Makowka that the Parmenter School had some snow brackets installed. S. Makowka will follow up with Planning Dept. about procedures.
5. New Business
Hearings (typically last around 20 minutes per application) 8:20pm
 - a. Continuation of Formal Hearing for 204 Pleasant Street (English) for wall. P. White represented owner of 204 Pleasant Street and said that owner was bothered that, after all the work done by him to improve the house, that he was being asked to tear this structure down. He really wants to keep it the way it was constructed. The architect told him of the

negative Commission's feedback from the prior meeting but he feels everything they did was appropriate and is not proposing any alterations. He stated that the building material type is questionable maybe. P. White then stated that the owner had looked at Mass General Law and wanted to know where this issue fit in the Commission's bylaws. He cited Section 6 – 'no building or structure may be constructed or altered which affects exterior architectural features....' and Section 5 – 'such portion of the building or structure....' Their concern was what is the definition of an "architectural feature" since they believed that a wall has no architectural features. Also they question whether it is considered to be a sign. P. White expressed the owner's uncertainty about why they're even here, since the wall does not affect architectural features and it is not a sign. S. Makowka noted that he had requested clarification from the applicant about why they believed that the wall was eligible for a Certificate of Non- Applicability when the application was initially filed because he determined that this was a jurisdictional change. He did not receive a reply. B. Cohen asked P. White what the wall it is – is it a structure, a sign, what is it. No answer. S. Makowka said the visible exterior of a building or a structure comes under our jurisdiction. A wall constructed on a property in a historic district has been and is considered a structure subject to our jurisdiction.

B. Cohen said we are concerned that there are no other precedents of that size or material that is set like that on a street in a District. S. Makowka said the issue is the lack of traditional materials – the modern granite slab and especially the tile wall. As sited, the tile is not historically appropriate with the District. Felt very strongly about that issue. The granite slab was an issue as well. Is one big slab of granite appropriate? Some of the walls shown in the photos provided by the applicant were in place before the District was created and are not necessarily historic. Looking at other examples helps, but just because it exists doesn't mean it's actually appropriate and should be approved. Owner asked his contractor to ask about a fence. The Commission noted that it is opposed to walling off the houses in an historic district. In some circumstances, we have allowed low, open fences that allow visual pass through. P. White asked about hedges. The Commission responded that it has no jurisdiction over plantings.

S. Makowka stated that the commission should act on the application at this time based on the information before it. He urged the applicant to consider proposing alternatives based on the feedback of the Commission. B. Cohen moved to deny applicant's request for a Certificate of Non Applicability dated 6/8/2011, based on the determination that (1) the subject wall is a structure under our jurisdiction and thus requires a Certificate of Appropriateness prior to installation; and (2) to date such Certificate of Appropriateness has not been issued by the Commission. Seconded by D. Levy. D. Levy, D. Baldwin, S. Makowka, B. Cohen, and J. Cummings all voted in favor of denial. T. Smurzynski abstained from the vote since he was not present at previous meetings.

ACCOMPANYING DOCUMENTS: APPLICATION AND PHOTOGRAPHS

- b. Informal Hearing for 15-15A Avon Place (Burke) for renovations. S. Makowka noted that this was an informal hearing to provide feedback and that the Commission could not actually consider or act on the proposed changes. B. Botterio and J. Burke present to discuss concepts of converting the two family house at 15 and 15a Avon Place back to its original single family and build a carriage house like structure for the second unit. D. Levy asked questions about the proposed pitch of the porch roof. Response: we are not doing anything to that roof, it is staying the way it is now. The applicant noted that the existing garage is a non-contributing structure and in terrible shape. They want to tear it down and put a 55' long by 20' wide carriage house in the location shown where there is evidence that an original barn or carriage house once stood. B. Cohen said the proposed building in the drawings presented looks like a house to her. No problem with it looking like a secondary building, but she feels that this needs to be less fancy so as not to draw away from the main house. Maybe a more simple secondary building, and she felt that the barn style

doors were not required. S. Makowka stated that is not a problem to him that the new structure not duplicate the mansard-style roof, but suggested that it be architecturally toned down so that it reads as an accessory building or a secondary residential building.

- c. **Informal Hearing for 10 Montague Street (Silverman) for renovations.** S. Makowka noted that this was an informal hearing to provide feedback and that the Commission could not actually consider or act on the proposed changes. J. Silverman is the new owner and showed pictures of deck above garage on Montague Street. He would like to convert the middle window in a bay to French doors to allow access to the existing elevated deck. To access the deck now, you need to go out from another room, down some stairs, across a patio, and then back up another set of stairs. The original windows around the house almost all been replaced with replacement windows. The Commissioners present indicated that given the circumstances, this alteration seemed reasonable. They discussed some alternatives and asked that detailed information including door specifications, site photos, and a site plane be provided with the application.

6. Other Business

- a. Preservation Loan Program Update – No update
- b. Outreach to Neighborhoods & Realtors – no update
- c. Updates to AHDC Commissioner Contact Information – To be distributed
- d. Discussion of potential Warrant Article submissions – Article to clarify enforcement provisions to be filed.
- e. Update of Project List by Commissioners

7. OPEN FORUM

Any matter presented for consideration of the Commission shall neither be acted upon, nor a formal decision made the night of the presentation

8. REVIEW OF PROJECTS (See project list below)

Project List:

- 1. 11 Westmoreland Avenue (Caruso 01-12M) 6/02 – Cohen-COA
- 2. 79 Crescent Hill (Moore, 04-5G) – Cohen-CONA
- 3. 75 Westminster Ave. (Dressler, 05-06M) – Makowka – COA
- 4. 175 Lowell Street (Erickson for Hill, 05-07M) – Cohen – COA
- 5. 15 Montague Street (Barkans, 05-08M) – Cohen – CONA
- 6. 105 Westminster Ave. (Orrigo – 05-27M) – Cohen – COA
- 7. 203 Lowell Street (Salocks & Stafford – 06-20M) – Potter – COA
- 8. 123 Westminster Ave. (Urgotis – 06-26M) – Makowka – CONA (Front Steps)
- 9. 152b Pleasant St. (Cury – 07-16P) – Worden – COA (Fence)
- 10. 10 Montague St. (Jirak – 07-20M) – Makowka – CONA (Fence Replacement)
- 11. 3 Westmoreland Ave. (Canty – 07-23M) – Makowka – CONA (Roof & Light)
- 12. 246 Pleasant St. (Eykamp – 07-48P) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
- 13. 149 Pleasant St. (Alberto – 07-53P) – Penzenik – COA (Porch Windows)
- 14. 23 Maple St. (Town of Arl. – 07-55P) – Makowka – COA (Trim, Siding, Vestibule, Windows)
- 15. 170 Pleasant St. (Gillis/Kelly – 07-56P) – Cohen – COA (Basement Windows)
- 16. 72 Westminster Ave. (Colman – 08-01M) – Cohen – COA (Front Porch)
- 17. 54 Jason Street (Zaphiris – 08-7P) – Makowka – CONA (Front Stairs, Step & Landing)
- 18. 34 Jason Street (Szymanski – 08-09P) – Makowka – CONA (Deck on Rear)
- 19. 26 Academy Street (Wright – 08-19P) – Cohen - COA (Deck, Landscaping)
- 20. 274-276 Broadway (Galvin -08-20B) – Makowka - CONA (Gutters, Roof)
- 21. 754 Mass. Ave. (Vorlicek – 08-31J) – Worden – COA (Handicap Lift, Stairs, Entry, Door)
- 22. 193 Westminster Ave. (Pemsler – 08-33M) – Cohen – COA (porch, siding removal, stairs)

23. 175 Pleasant Street (Lucchese – 08-34P) – Penzenik – COA (fence)
24. 204-206 Pleasant St. (English – 08-35P) – Penzenik – COA (windows, doorway, siding removal)
25. 3 Westmoreland Ave. (Canty/Eng – 08-39M) – Logan – COA (ac vent, screening)
26. 87 Pleasant St. (Calvert - 08-40P) – Makowka – CONA (porch deck & railings)
27. 21-23 Central St. (Mitchell/Dyer – 08-44C) – Makowka- COA (rear addition, stair, landing, roof)
28. 393-395 Mass. Ave. (Barkan – 08-45B) – Makowka - 10 Day COA (Shutters)
29. 14 Westmoreland Ave. (Leveille – 08-48M) – Makowka – CONA (Retaining Wall)
30. 25 Avon Place (Smith – 09-02A) – Cohen – COA (Solar Panels)
31. 187 Pleasant Street (Fox – 09-03P) – Levy – COA (Window Removal, Rear Addition)
32. 30 Jason Street (Mallio – 09-04J) – Makowka – CONA (Window Replacement)
33. 28 Academy Street (Rehrig – 09-05P) – Makowka – COA (Chimney, Porch, AC Units, Door)
34. 81 Westminster Ave. (Lemire – 09-06M) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
35. 187 Lowell Street (JK Construction – 09-07) – Cohen/Makowka – COA (New House, Old House)
36. 184 Westminster Ave. (Kahn – 09-10M) – Makowka – COA (Roof)
37. 215 Pleasant Street (Gruber – 09-11P – Levy – COA (Shed)
38. 160 Westminster Ave. (Jackson – 09-12M) – Makowka – COA (Addition Revision)
39. 156 Westminster Ave. (LaFleur/Ehlert – 09-13M) – Makowka – CONA (Driveway, Steps, Landing)
40. 3 Westmoreland Ave. (Canty/Eng – 09-17M) – Makowka – CONA (Driveway)
41. 179 Westminster (Cerundolo – 09-20M) – Cohen – COA (Porch, Trim, Siding Removal)
42. 187 Lowell (JK Construction – 09-21M) – Cohen/Makowka - COA (New House)
43. 203 Lowell Street (Salocks/Stafford – 09-22M) – Makowka – COA (Addition)
44. 37 Jason Street (Lees – 09-24J) – Cohen – COA (Deck)
45. 74 Pleasant Street (St Johns – 09-25P) – Worden – COA (Sign & lighting)
46. 86 Pleasant Street (Coyner – 09-26P) – Makowka – 10 Day COA (shutters)
47. 16 Central Street (Piechota -09-28C) – Makowka – CONA (Roof)
48. 3 Westmoreland Ave. (Eng/Canty – 09-30M) – Makowka – CONA (fence)
49. 79 Crescent Hill Ave. (Diaz – 09-31M) – Makowka – COA (door removal, stoop, window)
50. 35 Central Street (Budne – 09-38C) – Makowka – CONA (Porch-Chimney-Cap)
51. 204 Pleasant Street (Sirah RT – 09-39P) – Penzenik – COA (Rear Façade Changes)
52. 147 Lowell Street (Nyberg – 09-41M) – Smurzynski – COA (Deck)
53. 23 Jason Street (Leary – 09-42J) – Makowka – CONA (Roof)
54. 148-152 Pleasant Street (White – 09-44P) – Makowka – CONA (Clapboard Siding Repair)
55. 10 Montague Street (Jirak – 09-46M) – Makowka – CONA (Garage Deck Demolition)
56. 18 Central Street (Berlinski – 09-47C) – Makowka – CONA (Roof)
57. 17 Russell Street (Makowka – 09-48R) – Cohen – COA (Front Door Window)
58. 15A Avon Place (Burke – 10-01A) – Makowka – CONA (Gutters, Downspouts, Soffits, Porch, Facias, Windows)
59. 109 Westminster Ave. (Rines/Pascale – 10-03M) – Makowka – COA (Porch)
60. 15A Avon Place (Burke – 10-04A) – Makowka – COA (Windows)
61. 88 Westminster Ave. (Ryan – 10-05M) – Makowka – CONA (Windows on Rear of House)
62. 174 Westminster Ave. (Landwehr/Szaraz – 10-06M) – Makowka – CONA (Wood Window Repair)
63. 10 Montague Street (Jirak – 10-07M) – Makowka – COA (Railings)
64. 174 Westminster Ave. (Bush/Sheldon – 10-09M) – Makowka – CONA (Gutters)
65. 100 Pleasant Street (Shiffman – 10-10P) – Makowka - CONA (Roof)
66. 45 Jason Street (Hamilton – 10-10J) – Makowka – CONA (Roof)
67. 187 Pleasant Street (Fox – 10-11P) – Makowka – CONA (Guters, Siding, Woodwork, Trim)
68. 38 Russell Street (Mishkin – 10-12R) – Nyberg – COA (AC Compressor)
69. 23 Maple Street (Town of Arl. – 10-13P) – Makowka – CONA (Door)

70. 17 Russell Street (Makowka/Spring – 10-14R) – Cohen – COA (Railing)
71. 215 Pleasant Street (Gruber – 10-15P) – Penzenik – COA (Garage Door)
72. 187 Lowell Street (J&K Construction – 10-16M) – Makowka-Cohen – COA (Ext. of Old Certif)
73. 215 Pleasant Street (Gruber – 10-20P) – Makowka – CONA (Roof)
74. 193 Westminster (Pemsler - 10-21M) – Cohen – COA (Windows, Siding)
75. 22 Russell Street (McCabe – 10-23R) – Cohen – CONA (Chimney)
76. 30 Jason Street (Mallio – 10-24J) – Makowka – CONA (Porch-Steps)
77. 204 Pleasant Street (Sirah RT – 10-26P) – Penzenik – COA (Garage-Stairs-Siding-Doors)
78. 114 Westminster Ave. (Metzger – 10-28M) – Makowka – CONA (Shingles-Porch-Rafters)
79. 114 Westminster Ave. (Metzger – 10-29M) – Nyberg – COA (Windows)
80. 16 Avon Place (Capodanno – 10-31A) – Makowka – COA (Windows on Porch-Roof-Window)
81. 10 Jason Street (Young-Sullivan – 10-32J) – Cohen – COA (Chimney-Skylite)
82. 239 Pleasant Street (McKinnon – 10-33P) – Makowka – CONA (Roof)
83. 272 Broadway (Danieli-Crispin – 10-37B) – Makowka – CONA (Rear Door)
84. 123 Westminster Ave. (Urgotis – 10-38M) – Makowka – CONA (Porch Columns)
85. 272 Broadway (Danieli-Crispin – 10-39B) – Makowka – COA (Doors)
86. 272 Broadway (Danieli-Crispin – 10-40B) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
87. 193 Westminster Ave. (Pemsler – 10-41M) – Cohen – COA (Siding Removal-Clapboard-Windows)
88. 3 Westmoreland Ave. (Canty-Eng – 10-42M) – Makowka – CONA (Window Sash)
89. 246 Pleasant Street (Eykamp – 10-43P) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
90. 14 Westmoreland Ave. (Leveille – 10-45M) – Makowka – CONA (Vinyl Siding Removal-Shingle Repair on Areas Not Visible from Public View)
91. 22-24 Avon Place (Sayigh) – 10-46A) – Makowka – CONA (Door Threshold)
92. 25 Elder Terrace (Hussain – 10-47M) – Makowka – CONA (Roof, Gutters, Down Spouts)
93. 52-54 Westminster Ave. (O'Shea – 10-49M) – Makowka – COA (Door)
94. 23 Water Street (Whitford – 10-50R) – Cohen – COA (Addition-Siding-Windows)
95. 14 Westmoreland Ave. (Leveille – 10-51M) – Cohen – COA (Siding-Attic Windows)
96. 12 Elder Terrace (Folkers – 10-53M) – Cohen – COA (Garage)
97. 24 Jason Street (Smith-Towner – 10-54J) – Makowka – CONA (Stairs-Handrail)
98. 17 Pelham Terrace (Choi – 10-54P) – Makowka – COA (Chimney Removal)
99. 17 Pelham Terrace (Choi – 10-55P) – Makowka – CONA (Rear Door-Window-Skylights)
100. 125 Pleasant Street (Abate – 10-57P) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
101. 160 Westminster Ave. (Jackson – 10-58M) – Makowka – CONA (Fence)
102. 1 Monadnock Road (Starks-Hopeman – 10-59P) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
103. 7 Avon Place (Davidson – 10-60A) – Makowka – CONA (Window Repair)
104. 19 Westmoreland Ave. (Naar – 11-01M) – Makowka – CONA (Porch-Stairs-Rail-Trim)
105. 8 Wellington Street (Salvation Army – 11-02P) – Makowka – CONA (Roof)
106. 38 Russell Street (Mishkin – 11-03R) – Nyberg – COA (Rear Addition-Attic Window)
107. 50 Westmoreland Ave. (Sessa – 11-04M) – Makowka – CONA (Shingles)
108. 215 Pleasant Street (Gruber – 11-05P) – Makowka – CONA (Garage Repair)
109. 187 Lowell Street (JK Construction – 11-06M) – Makowka/Cohen (New Construction)
110. 188-190 Westminster Ave. (Kokubo – 11-08M) – Penzenik – COA (Addition-Windows)
111. 69 Crescent Hill Ave. (Bush-Sheldon – 11-09M) – Makowka (Siding-Deck-Windows)
112. 114 Westminster Ave. (Fleming-Metzger – 11-10M) – Makowka – CONA (Rear Deck)
113. 163 Pleasant Street (Davidson – 11-11P) – Makowka – CONA (Fascia Board-Rafter Rails)
114. 157 Lowell Street (Stevens – 11-12M) – Makowka – CONA (Railing)
115. 69 Crescent Hill Ave. (Bush-Sheldon – 11-13M) – Nyberg – COA (Shingles/Clapboard)
116. 218 Pleasant Street (Plokhii – 11-14P) – Makowka – DENIAL COA (Siding)
117. 30 Academy Street (McKee – 11-17P) – Penzenik – COA (Wall)
118. 19 Maple Street (Hirani – 11-18P) – Penzenik – COA (Shed-Garage)

119. 20 Prescott Street (Cohen – 11-19R) – Cohen – COA (Addition)
120. 44 Academy Street (Gevalt/Bachrach -11-21P) – Penzenik – COA (Shed)
121. 35 Jason Street (Lynch – 11-22J) – Makowka – COA (Rear Deck and Addition)
122. 35 Central Street (Budne – 11-24C) – Makowka – CONA (Rails-Stairs-Porch)
123. 21 Montague Street (Elwell/Nemec – 11-25M) – Makowka – CONA (Fascia-Porch-Rail)
124. 33 Russell Street (Littlewood – 11-26R) – Makowka – CONA (Porch-Gutters-Clapboards)
125. 35 Academy Street (Knoblock – 11-27P) – Makowka – CONA (Porch Repair)
126. 60 Pleasant St., Unit 513 (Engels – 11-28P) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
127. 157 Lowell Street (Stevens – 11-32M) – Makowka – CONA (Fence)
128. 187 Lowell Street (Nyberg – 11-33M) – Makowka-Cohen – COA (New Construction)
129. 60 Pleasant Street (Condo Assoc – 11-34P) – Makowka – CONA (Balconies-Facades) –
130. 23-29 Academy Street (Chiccarelli-Benn – 11-35P) – Makowka – CONA (Fence)
131. 111 Pleasant Street (Fredieu – 11-36P) – Makowka – CONA (Roof-Downspouts-Gutters-Foundation)
132. 20 Russell Street, #1 (Briggs – 11-37R) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
133. 100 Pleasant St. #31 (Greenfield – 11-38P) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
134. 170 Pleasant Street (Gillis-Kely – 11-39P) – Levy – COA (Basement Windows)
135. 19 Jason Street (Dargon-Green – 11-40J) – Cohen – COA (Rear Deck-Stairway-Rails on Front)
136. 160 Westminster Ave. (Jackson – 11-41M) – Nyberg – 10 Day COA (Shed)
137. 252 Pleasant Street (Schweich – 11-42P) – Nyberg – 10 Day COA (Walls)
138. 734 Mass. Ave. (Davidson – 11-43P) – Makowka – CONA (Siding-Corner Boards)
139. 742 Mass. Ave. (Davidson – 11-44J) – Makowka – CONA (Facia)
140. 201 Pleasant Street (Kantor – 11-45P) – Makowka – CONA (Eaves-Sills-Facia)
141. 52-54 Westminster Ave. (O'Shea – 11-46M) – Makowka – CONA (Rear Deck/Porch)
142. 19 Academy Street (Masonic Lodge – 11-47P) – Makowka – CONA (Ramp on Rear)
143. 32 Academy Street (Chasteen – 11-48P) - Makowka – CONA (Windows on Rear)
144. 111 Pleasant Street (Frideau – 11-49) – Nyberg – COA (Fence)
145. 161 Westminster Ave. (Lancelotta – 11-50M) – Black – COA (Gutters)
146. 187 Westminster Ave. (Danaher-Obrien – 11-51M) – Makowka – CONA (Roof)
147. 187 Lowell Street (Grinnell – 11-52M) – Makowka – 10 Day COA (Door and Windows)
148. 7 Westmoreland Ave. (Levy – 11-53M) – Nyberg – COA (Skylights)
149. 100 Pleasant Street (Addison Corner Condo – 11-54P) – Makowka – CONA (roof)
150. 23 Jason Street (Leary – 11-55J) – Makowka – CONA (Roof)

Meeting Adjourned 9:45pm

Carol Greeley
 Executive Secretary
 cc: HDC Commissioners
 Arlington Historical Commission, JoAnn Robinson-Chair
 Building Inspector, Mr. Michael Byrne
 Building Dept., Richard Vallarelli
 Planning Dept. and Redevelopment Board, Ms. Carol Kowalski
 Massachusetts Historical Commission
 Town Clerk
 Robbins Library
 MIS Department